

# AB 617 Steering Committee Meeting Agenda

2/16/2021

6:00 pm - 8:00 pm

Virtual Meeting via Zoom

[Click here for meeting materials](#)

## Meeting Objectives

- Provide update of Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP)
- Recruit Steering Committee (SC) support for CERP Public Workshops in March 2021

## Meeting Action Items

- Approval of 1/19/2020 Meeting Notes and meeting Agenda
- Unanimously voted to submit a letter to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) requesting a two-month extension to the CERP deadline to accommodate new board members to the SDAPCD

## Agenda

- I. Welcoming Remarks (Daniela Simunovic and Chuy Flores, Facilitators) 6:00 pm**
- Review Meeting Objectives & Agenda
  - Roll call SC members
  - Updates
    - New staff at SDAPCD: **Monica Melgoza**
    - New Interpreter: **Frida Bloom**
    - SC Membership Changes:
      - Janice Reynoso** will be Mothers Out Front's new primary representative.
      - Martin Reeder** is now National City's new primary representative.
      - Joy Williams** will now be EHC's primary member. **Jorge Gonzalez** will be alternate.
      - Sandy Naranjo** will now be the Port's primary member. **Larry H** will be alternate.
      - SDAPCD will be contacting and considering replacements for a few community members due to chronic absences.
    - As a result of AB 423
      - March 2021, a new SDAPCD Board will be in place
      - This will have no direct impact on AB 617 day to day
      - This new Board will review CERP for final approval
- II. Approval of 1/19/2021 Meeting Notes and tonight's agenda (Daniela Simunovic) 6:10 pm**
- Motion** to approve January 2021 meeting notes and tonight's agenda with no changes by **Josephine Talamantez**
    - Seconded by **Sandy Naranjo**
  - MOTION PASSED Unanimously**
- III. Subcommittee Updates 6:15 pm**
- Maritime Clean Air Strategy (MCAS) – Larry Hofreiter
    - Group continues to meet every two weeks.
    - Group is now pivoting from establishing background and emission sources to working with subcommittee members and other stakeholders on establishing goals.
      - Vision is to reach consensus on what should the near and long-term goals of the ports should be to address identified emission sources.
    - Subcommittee would also like to release a MCAS discussion draft out for review in mid-March/early April to collect feedback from stakeholders before going before Board in May to provide the Port with recommendations.
    - The group provided a status update to the Board of Port Commissioners on 2/11/21.

- v. Special shout-out to Dr. Yoon, Silvia Calzada, Alicia Sanchez, and Maritza Garcia for providing testimony.
  - vi. Big picture: Board of Port Commissioners is largely on board with the MCAS subcommittee and wants group to continue working with stakeholders.
- b. Comments and Questions:
- (A) **Sandy Naranjo:** Echoed Larry's summary and thanks to folks that participated in last week's meeting. Shared that both herself and the Chairman of the Board have identified MCAS as a priority.

#### IV. Presentation: CERP Update (Domingo Vigil, SDAPCD)

6:20 pm

- a. Review CERP Timeline
- i. SDAPCD would like to ask CARB for a time extension for the CERP due to changes at the Air District Board due to AB 423
  - ii. CERP Public Workshops are tentatively scheduled for March 23<sup>rd</sup> (Day), March 24<sup>th</sup> (Evening)
  - iii. Reminder that CARB will be also be hosting public workshops in March regarding their response to the Navy Shipyard Fire which may exhaust public's participation in CERP related public workshops.
    - (A) An extension could help maximize robust community engagement.
- b. Comments and Questions:
- i. **Josephine Talamantez:** Will the SC be receiving the dates and Zoom link invites for upcoming public workshops?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** Yes, attendance information will be sent out once dates are finalized. Outreach will also include the public at large in the area.
  - ii. **Roman Partida-Lopez:** Is there any potential impacts that come with extending the deadline?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** We have not identified any as far as funding goes and don't foresee any negative impacts from an extension.
  - iii. **Sandy Naranjo:** How should we proceed forward with CERP extension?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** Recommended putting up for a vote.
  - iv. **David Flores:** How will extension impact timeline next steps?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** Process will remain the same. The extension would potentially move the workshops to April, so they are not concentrated in March. Comments would be gathered throughout April and any pending issues would be addressed in May. CERP could then be proposed to APCD Board in June or July and then submit the final CERP to CARB by August.
  - v. **Silvia Calzada:** Can you confirm that extension will not impact other deadlines outside of APCD? Are there other deadlines that will affect our CERP?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** We do not anticipate that from the current strategies.
- c. **Motion** to formally request CARB for a two-month extension to the CERP deadline to accommodate new board members to the SDAPCD by **Sandy Naranjo**
- i. Seconded by **Joy Williams**
  - ii. **MOTIONED PASSED**
- d. Overview of CERP Strategies
- i. Link to Draft CERP:
    - [https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB\\_617/CERP\\_Chapter\\_7.docx](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/CERP_Chapter_7.docx)
  - ii. The document is almost complete and ready to be presented before public workshop
- e. Comments and Questions from SC:
- i. **David Flores:** Offered thanks to Domingo and APCD for their hard work on refinements.
  - ii. **Jack Monger:** Regarding Action F6, what is a Health Equity Summary?
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** We coordinated with SANDAG and County Health and Human Services Agency for this effort. The focus is to ensure the transit strategies and planning efforts are in line with creating positive health impacts for the communities

where these changes will be occurring.

- (B) **Elisa Arias** tried to make a comment however she was unable to get her audio to work. She gave a thumbs up to express support with Domingo's response to Jack.
- iii. **Jack Monger**: Called to page 44, "Phase 2 Support." Mention of building affordable housing but potentially may be located near a freeway. Called attention to existing guidelines from CARB regarding the distance constructing new housing from freeways. Moving on to Action G4 under "Strategies and Goals," what was the feedback there regarding what these goals mean?
  - (A) **Larry Hofreiter**: This was looked at and reflects direction of the state. Timeline provided reflects direction of state regulatory requirements. We have already applied for a grant for an electric ferry and will be sure to reach out to ferry operators after it is put out for review to ask for additional feedback.
- iv. **Jack Monger**: Raised flag again to other calls for building affordable housing near freeways in National City as indicated on bottom of page 45 under "Implementing Agency, organizations, Business or Other Entity."
  - (A) **Domingo Vigil**: Assured that these recommendations were made in coordination with City Planners but will circle back.
- v. **Joy Williams**: Wanted to further clarify the Health Equity Assessments: They are meant to identify and address the health disparities between portside communities and general public of the San Diego Region.

**V. Presentation: CERP Goals (Joy Williams, EHC)**

**6:50 pm**

- a. Link to presentation:  
[https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB\\_617/EHC\\_Recommended\\_CE\\_RP\\_GOALS.pdf](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/EHC_Recommended_CE_RP_GOALS.pdf)
- b. Comments and Questions from SC:
  - i. **Derry Pence**: What is the baseline for the emissions reduction and increase in canopy coverage so that achieving the goal can be measured?
    - (A) **Joy Williams**: That would rely on existing tree counts conducted by the cities.
  - ii. **A.C. Dumaua**: Comment on Goals 1-4. Raised concern there may not be any concrete data based on modeling approach. Reminder that Health Risk Assessment are theoretical calculations which may result in inaccurate data. Suggested there should be more data generated to produce more accurate results.
  - iii. **Larry Hofreiter**: Raised three problematic goals from Port's perspective.
    - (A) Goal 4: Not sure if that goal is possible and Port does not have an MOU with CARB. Preference would be to have AB 617 CERP establish a cancer risk assessment for entire community based on AB 617 monitoring that is taking place.
    - (B) Goal 7: It is doable, but follow-up is needed to double check with SDG&E to understand their programs and how they can support
    - (C) Goal 11: Not sure how to accomplish based on limited land by waterfront. Secondly, port staff does not have authority to authorize that vision without support from entire Board of Port Commissioners. Look for ways to tweak language to avoid appearance of putting authorization power up to the Board.
  - iv. **Jack Monger**: Raised some concerns on the following goals.
    - (A) Goal 1: Recommended Steering Committee hold off on Goal 1 because APCD staff has been directed to evaluate the cancer risk and determine if should be shifted. It may be premature to call for a specific target before their analysis is complete.
    - (B) Goal 6: Reminded Steering Committee that the state CARB has put out robust guidance on how to achieve 100% ZEV by 2035 so it would be arbitrary for the SC to deliver 5 years early without scientific proof of how that would be achieved.
  - v. **Josephine Talamantez**: How can the Steering Committee make data collecting a priority? Raised that there is available land to be expanded for park space and asked for next steps for follow-up.

- (A) **Domingo Vigil:** CARB is working on providing us with additional data and modeling to supplement the data coming from operational monitors. CARB will present to the Steering Committee in the coming months. Regarding the goals, they are meant to be aspirational that dictate the direction for the community rather than rules that will be enforced.
- vi. **Ashely Valentin Gonzalez:** Asked to further explore the concept of this being an APCD plan that could be implemented. Raised flag that as written, the rules do not appear in a format that the APCD could get behind and support. There should be a pathway to attaining them.
- vii. **Helen K. Haase:** Asked for clarification regarding Goal 9c, because it was unclear when Navy committed to increasing tree canopy and vegetative barriers along Harbor Drive
  - (A) **Joy Williams:** Clarified that this action is a suggestion that the Navy could participate in.
- viii. **Margarita Moreno:** Noted that it would be a big step forward in addressing the cancer risks and increasing green space if the Ports follow the truck guidelines. Also supported idea that CERP should take as much monitoring data as possible and ensure everyone is doing their part. Anything that can be advanced can be a win.
- ix. **Dr. Sabrina Perrino:** Raised that the working group should have access to data from local hospitals on cancer stats and childhood asthma rates.
- x. **Roman Partida-Lopez:** Suggested if group can take an approach of outlining how to meet these goals before determining that they're not attainable. Some of these goals have been identified by our communities, so the group should exhaust avenues before deciding to remove.
- xi. **Elisa Arias:** Raised that for some of the goals, it would be useful to establish a baseline to help in tracking progress overtime.
- xii. **Janice Reynoso:** Raised that when Steering Committee discusses park space, it does not necessarily need to refer to large parcels of land, there could be pocket parks, community gardens or extensions of parking structures that can facilitate green space. Reminded group that these goals can be attainable with community support/input and assistance from subject matter experts.
- xiii. **Monseratt Hernandez:** Emphasized for representatives from government agencies and the Port that the bottom line is addressing folks' overall health. Joy mentioned cancer but there are many other health impacts affecting vulnerable communities especially seniors and children. It is not ok to say that the group can't achieve these goals and have to wait because the time to act is now.
- xiv. **Silvia Calzada:** Affirmed Janice's comment. Raised her own experience as a resident working with EHC in their community engagement process to construct the Paradise Creek affordable housing project which has brought real benefits to the community.
- xv. **Dr. Stephanie Yoon:** Raised that many of the pollutants that are associated with cancer are also associated with lung, heart and other problems. So, in reducing cancer risk we will also hopefully be reducing many other health problems.
- xvi. **Joy Williams:** Regarding next steps, subcommittee will be taking another look at the goals based on feedback provided today.

**VI. Presentation: SDG&E's Power Your Drive for Fleets program (Lianna Rios, SDG&E) 7:15 pm**

- a. [Link to presentation:](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/VI_Presentation_SDGE-PYDF-Program%20Overview_Bilingual.pdf)  
[https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB\\_617/VI\\_Presentation\\_SDGE-PYDF-Program%20Overview\\_Bilingual.pdf](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/VI_Presentation_SDGE-PYDF-Program%20Overview_Bilingual.pdf)
- b. Comments and Questions:
  - i. **Roman Partida-Lopez:** Does the program give any priorities to disadvantaged communities?
    - (A) **Lianna Rios:** There is an aggressive goal that 30% of the budget must be spent in disadvantaged communities. There is a strong desire to install infrastructure in those areas but there is not explicit program language differentiating DACs from

other locations. However, sites located in DACs would be weighted more heavily compared to sites that are not.

- ii. **Domingo Vigil:** How long is the program in place?
  - (A) **Lianna Rios:** The program will be in place for the next 5-6 years.

## VII. Update: Creation of Idling Vehicle Subcommittee (Tim Wolf, SDAPCD)

7:40 pm

- a. Goal: Obtain community feedback to identify locations for inspection
- b. [Link to idling map:](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/VII_APCD_Idling_Map.pdf)  
[https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB\\_617/VII\\_APCD\\_Idling\\_Map.pdf](https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/dam/sdc/apcd/PDF/AB_617/VII_APCD_Idling_Map.pdf)
- c. Presentation Notes:
  - i. SDAPCD is considering expanding the enforcement program and wants to identify ways to improve these inspections to ensure SDAPCD is meeting the needs of community members, determine performance metrics, and conduct public outreach.
  - ii. This subcommittee would meet regularly to discuss idling problems and figure out how to improve existing program, expand it, and conduct public outreach.
  - iii. Contact information:
    - (A) Email – [tim.wolff@sdcounty.ca.gov](mailto:tim.wolff@sdcounty.ca.gov)
    - (B) Phone – (858) 967-6241
- d. Comments and Questions:
  - i. **Bradley Bang:** Offered thanks to the individuals representing his community on the committee for helping increase awareness of environmental justice issues and pollution affecting portside communities. Raised flag that there is a scheduling conflict that overlaps with the National City Council Meeting making it difficult to watch and participate in both.
  - ii. **Ted Godshalk:** Is there a reason the map does not include the National City and the Tidelands Avenue area?
    - (A) **Tim Wolf:** SDAPCD is down there; however, there are not as many homes in that area. This would not make it considered a restricted area in terms of idling terminology. There have been violations found those locations as well.
  - iii. **Monica Melgoza:** Asked what the commitment requirements are to be a part of the subcommittee?
  - iv. **Josephine Talamantez:** Do the red markers on the slide represent places where idling is taking place?
    - (A) **Time Wolf:** Yes, those are hotspots.
  - v. **Daniela Simunovic:** Folks interested in joining can either put their name in the chat box or email Tim.

## VIII. Public Comments

7:50 pm

- a. Reserved for comments on items not listed on the agenda
- b. Each speaker is limited to 3 minutes
- c. **Liliana Nunez (CARB)** – Wanted to clarify that CARB does not have authority to grant deadlines since it is outlined in statute. For the last extension request, CARB recommended the SDAPCD and SC work closely to determine what could be implemented now versus what needs more time. However, CARB is still supportive of most recent request to extend deadline.
- d. **Silvia Calzada:** Had three updates:
  - i. Welcomed and recognized Martin Reeder from National City to the Steering Committee
  - ii. Asked if there has been an SDAPCD update regarding an Environmental Justice Office, specifically regarding who to contact if community members have questions.
    - (A) **Domingo Vigil:** Clarified that **Monica Melgoza** and himself are currently the dedicated staff to the office so they would be points of contact. Will be sending an email out to their email lists to make that clarification and ensure folks have their contact information.
  - iii. Flagged that Supervisor Nora Vargas is in the development of developing an EJ

taskforce for District 1 and recommended that the EJ Office should collaborate with the taskforce.

- e. **Janice Reynoso:** Flagged that portside residents can qualify for a free tree program thanks to a partnership between local non-profits and National City + Barrio Logan. The program looks to distribute over 1,000 trees in residential areas including apartments if given permission to do so. For questions, please reach out to Janice at
  - i. Email - [janice@mundogardens.com](mailto:janice@mundogardens.com)
  - ii. Phone - 619-988-4392

**IX. Closing Remarks (Daniela Simunovic, Facilitator and Domingo Vigil, SDAPCD) 7:55 pm**  
a. Committee feedback on meeting, future agenda topics

**X. Adjourn 8:00pm**

Next scheduled meeting is 3/16/2021 Tentatively Virtual Meeting via Zoom

# Portside Communities Steering Committee Attendance and Vote Sheet

Date: February 16, 2021

Name	Affiliation	Present	Primary/ Alternate	Vote: Extension request to CARB	Motion 2
<b>1. Ashley Rosia-Tremonti</b>	<b>City of San Diego</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Christi Dadachanji	City of San Diego				
<b>2. Jack Monger</b>	<b>Industry (IEA)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Massie Hatch	Industry (Hatch Consulting)	X			
<b>3. Sara Giobbi</b>	<b>Industry (NASSCO)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Dennis DuBard	Industry (NASSCO)				
<b>4. Sandy Naranjo</b>	<b>Port of San Diego</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Larry Hofreiter	Port of San Diego	X			
<b>5. Elisa Arias</b>	<b>SANDAG</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Keri Robinson	SANDAG				
<b>6. Joy Williams</b>	<b>Other Agencies (EHC)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Jorge Gonzalez	Other Agencies (EHC)	X			
<b>7. Martin Reeder</b>	<b>Other Agencies (National City)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Chris Stanley	Other Agencies (National City)				
<b>8. Roman Partida-Lopez</b>	<b>Other Agencies (The Greenlining Institute)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>9. Stephanie Yoon</b>	<b>Medical Expert</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Sabrina Perrino	Medical Expert	X			
<b>10. Jose I. Marquez-Chavez</b>	<b>Other Agencies (CALTRANS)</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Diane Vermeulen	Other Agencies (CALTRANS)	X			
<b>11. AC Dumauual</b>	U.S. Navy	X			
a. Helen K. Haase	US Navy	X			
<b>12. Lianna Rios</b>	<b>SDG&amp;E</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
a. Joseph Gabaldon	SDG&E				
<b>13. Philomena Marino</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>14. Janice Reynoso</b>	<b>Mothers Out Front</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>15. Ted Godshalk</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>16. Hilary Medina</b>	<b>Community</b>				
<b>17. Alicia Sanchez</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>	<b>Present</b>	<b>Primary/ Alternate</b>	<b>Vote: Extension request to CARB</b>	<b>Motion 2</b>
<b>18.Margarita Moreno</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>19.Irma Ortiz</b>	<b>Community</b>				
<b>20.Olympia Andrade Beltran</b>	<b>Community</b>				
<b>21.Vanessa Contreras</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>22.Salvador Razo Abrica</b>	<b>Union Representative</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>23.Monserrat Hernandez</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>24.Silvia Calzada</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>25.Ashley Valentin Gonzalez</b>	<b>Community</b>				
<b>26.Josephine Talamantez</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>27. Maritza Garcia</b>	<b>Community</b>	<b>X</b>		<b>Y</b>	
<b>28.Nahomi Sanchez</b>	<b>Community</b>				
	<b>Hand Vote Aye</b>				
	<b>Hand Vote Nay</b>				
	<b>Hand Vote Abstain</b>				
	<b>Roll Call Vote Aye</b>			<b>22</b>	
	<b>Roll Call Vote Nay</b>			<b>0</b>	
	<b>Roll Call Vote Abstain</b>			<b>0</b>	