



AB 617 Portside Community Steering Committee

Agenda + Meeting Notes

5/24/2022

5:00 pm - 7:00 pm

Virtual Meeting viz Zoom

[Click here for meeting materials](#)

Meeting Objectives

- Learn about and provide input on the Health Risk Assessment for the Portside Community co-developed by the San Diego County Air Pollution Control District (SDAPCD), California Air Resources Board (CARB), and Port of San Diego
- Receive update on the Portside Air Quality Improvement and Relief (PAIR) Program from Environmental Health Coalition (EHC)

Meeting Action Items

- [Approval of 4/26/2022 meeting notes and May meeting agenda](#)

Agenda

- I. Welcoming Remarks (Chuy Flores & Joanny Leyva, Co-Facilitators) 5:00 pm**
 - a. Review Meeting Objectives & Agenda
 - b. Roll call Community Steering Committee (CSC) members
 - c. General Updates
 - i. **Domingo Vigil** thanked members who signed on to the letter of support for Assembly Bill 2141 (E. Garcia). The proposed legislation would provide ongoing funding to support the implementation of the Community Air Protection Program. As of May 23, the Assembly Appropriations Committee and State Assembly have passed AB 2141 for the State Senate to consider.
- II. Approval of 4/26/2022 Meeting Notes and tonight's agenda 5:10 pm**
 - a. **Motion to approve April Meeting Notes and tonight's agenda with no changes by Josephine Talamantez.**
 - i. Seconded by **Silvia Calzada**
 - b. **MOTION PASSED** unanimously
- III. Presentation: Health Risk Assessment for the Portside Community (SDAPCD, CARB, Port of San Diego) 5:15 pm**
 - a. [Link to CARB presentation](#); [Link to Port of San Diego Presentation](#)
 - b. **Melissa Venecek** and **Xue Meng Chen** provided an overview of CARB's modeling objectives and summarized the major contributors to cumulative population-weighted average risk based on the emissions inventory used.
 - c. **Larry Hofreiter** and **Matthew McFalls** (Ascent Environmental) presented on the Port's efforts to better understand how emissions at the Port impact the health of nearby community residents. Using 2019 activity data, the Port estimated the baseline cancer risk and anticipated improvements from the implementation of the Maritime Clean Air Strategy.
 - d. Questions and comments
 - i. **John Alvarado** asked if the data included the pollutants blowing in south from the LA Basin and Long Beach.



San Diego County
**Air Pollution
Control District**

- (A) **Melissa Venecek** responded that the map includes portions of Riverside and Orange County, but does not extend up to Los Angeles.
- ii. **Sharon Bernie-Cloward** asked if the report considered emissions from the airport separately.
 - (A) **Melissa Venecek** shared that airport emissions fall under the “Other sources” on the map.
- iii. **Jack Monger** asked what the “Ocean Going Vessels” category included.
 - (A) **Leonardo Ramirez** responded that the category includes auto carriers, bulk cargo vessels, passenger ships, refrigerated cargo vessels, roll-on/roll-off vessels, and tankers. Sport fishing vessels are included in the commercial harbor craft category.
 - (B) **Jack Monger** asked if the correction that sport fishing vessels spend more time at sea than in the harbor is reflected in the reports.
 - a. **Melissa Venecek** responded that she will follow up on this item because she is unsure if this version of the report included the updates.
- iv. A member asked if ocean-going vessels include navy vessels?
 - (A) **Melissa Venecek** responded that it does.
- v. **Silvia Calzada** asked if there is a table on the website defining the types of emissions.
 - (A) **Lilliana Nunez** provided the following resource:
 - a. https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2022-05/Portside_CSC_Reference_Material_052422_Bilingual.pdf
- vi. **Joy Williams** commented that for the purpose of setting a goal for reduction, it makes sense to include emissions from the harbor area because CERP can address the local emissions. She added that it also makes sense to try to reduce on-road emissions instead of waiting for state policies.
 - (A) **Melissa Venecek** clarified that all sources are included in regional modeling.
 - (B) **Jeremy Avise** added that CARB has the intention to update and incorporate suggestions into their modeling. They have not finished the full state-wide toxics modeling and plan to finish this version by the end of the year.
 - (C) **Joy Williams** responded that it is not clear how they incorporate suggestions to set the health risk reduction goal.
 - a. **Domingo Vigil** stated that the subcommittee can follow up on the discussion to figure out how to best use the information.
- vii. **Silvia Calzada** suggested providing more information on the types of emissions being measured in the future.
- viii. **Jack Monger** commented that he sees a problem with the categorization of emission sources. He highlighted the confusion with sport fishing boats that do not spend much time on the harbor.
 - (A) **Melissa Venecek** responded that they can connect offline to review the methodology used to categorize vessels.
 - (B) **John Alvarado** echoed Jack’s comment that fishing vessels do not spend much time in the port.
- ix. **William Duvall** asked how the methodology of this study compares to the latest SCAQMD MATES study.
 - (A) **Jeremy Avise** responded that they conducted the MATES study only using photochemical modeling. CARB’s modeling uses photochemical modeling as well as a dispersion model.
- x. **Janice Reynoso** asked if navy ships are releasing emissions when parked.
 - (A) **Liliana Nunez** replied that there are different types of boats that would be



San Diego County
**Air Pollution
Control District**

releasing emissions.

(B) **Jack Monger** replied that navy ships shut down as soon as they are in the port and do not contaminate the water when parked.

- xi. **Larry Hofreiter** highlighted that this is the first time CARB, the Port, and the District are working together on this issue and that with more data they will be able to make more informed decisions.
 - (A) **Sharon Bernie-Cloward** echoed Larry's comment and asked if there is any work on the City of San Diego's side.
 - a. **Domingo Vigil** replied that the district does some work to reduce emissions on the community level.
- xii. **Becky Vesterfelt** asked if cruise ships fall under the passenger ship category.
 - (A) **Leonardo** replied that they do.
- xiii. **Janice Reynoso** asked if other social determinants of health, like COVID, are also being considered as part of the baseline.
 - (A) **Larry Hofreiter** replied that he agrees that it is necessary to consider these additional variables.
- xiv. **John Alvarado** commented that considering the high percentage of cancer risk in the community areas, it is possible that there are more contaminants coming from the port than predicted.
- xv. **Sharon Bernie-Cloward** thanked the Port for helping set a target for reductions.
- xvi. **Joy Williams** thanked the Port for including the steering committee's recommendations. She flagged the differences in data between the Port and CARB.
- xvii. **Silvia Calzada** asked if there is an idea on how to approach rail switches.
 - (A) **Larry Hofreiter** replied that he does not currently have an approach, but they have begun to have preliminary conversations.
 - (B) **Matthew McFalls** added that they are aware of incremental improvements and will figure out how to capture them.
- xviii. **John Alvarado** shared used filters from his sleep apnea machine to demonstrate the high number of contaminants being filtered where he lives. He has to replace filters earlier than required by the manufacturer because of how quickly they get dirty. He urged the committee to call on the state to allocate resources to the community for home filtration systems.

IV. Update: Portside Air Quality Improvement and Relief Program (Leticia Ayala, EHC) 6:15 pm

- a. [Link to presentation](#)
- b. **Letty Ayala** provided an update on the implementation of the PAIR program. Letty shared about EHC's outreach process for distributing the air filtration and monitoring equipment as well as the number of residents contacted to-date.
- c. Questions and comments
 - i. **John Alvarado** asked how many cubic feet the filters cover and highlighted the importance of whole-house ventilation systems.
 - (A) **David Sodeman** shared that according to the manufacturer, the filtration unit filters 1,862 ft² per hour.
 - ii. **Nick Cormier** thanked EHC for their work.

V. Public Comments (Chuy Flores, Co-Facilitator) 6:45 pm

- a. Reserved for comments on items not listed on the agenda
- b. Each speaker is limited to 3 minutes



San Diego County
**Air Pollution
Control District**

VI. Closing Remarks

6:55 pm

- a. Committee feedback on meeting, future agenda topics

VII. Adjourn

7:00 pm

Next scheduled meeting is 6/28/2022 Tentatively Virtual Meeting via Zoom

Portside Community Steering Committee Attendance and Vote Sheet

Date: May 24, 2022

Name	Affiliation	Present	Primary/ Alternate	Voting Item: N/A	
1. Keith Corry	City of San Diego	X	P		
a. Shelby Buso	City of San Diego	X	A		
2. Jack Monger	Industry (IEA)	X	P		
a. Massie Hatch	Industry (Hatch Consulting)	X	A		
3. Sara Giobbi	Industry (NASSCO)	X	P		
a. Lydia Pellecer	Industry (BAE)	X	A		
4. Sandy Naranjo	Port of San Diego		P		
a. Larry Hofreiter	Port of San Diego	X	A		
5. Phil Trom	SANDAG	X	P		
a. Keri Robinson	SANDAG		A		
6. Joy Williams	EHC	X	P		
7. Martin Reeder	National City		P		
a. David Welch	National City		A		
8. Roman Partida-Lopez	The Greenlining Institute		P		
9. Stephanie Yoon	Medical Expert	X	P		
a. Alejandro Z. Diaz	Medical Expert		A		
10. Diane Vermeulen	CALTRANS	X	P		
11. Samantha Lui	U.S. Navy	X	P		
a. Helen K. Haase	US Navy	X	A		
12. Dinah Willier	SDG&E	X	P		
a. Joseph Gabaldon	SDG&E		A		
13. Philomena Marino	Community	X	P		
14. Janice Luna Reynoso	Mothers Out Front	X	P		
15. John Alvarado	Community	X	P		
16. Hilary Medina	Community		P		
17. Alicia Sanchez	Community	X	P		
18. Margarita Moreno	Community	X	P		
19. Nahomi Sanchez	Community		P		
20. Vanessa Contreras	Community	X	P		

Name	Affiliation	Present	Primary/ Alternate	Voting Item: N/A	
21.Salvador Razo Abrica	Union Representative	X	P		
22.Monserrat Hernandez	Community	X	P		
23.Silvia Calzada	Community	X	P		
24.Ashley Valentin Gonzalez	Community		P		
25.Josephine Talamantez	Community	X	P		
26. Maritza Garcia	Community	X	P		
	Total Primary (Total Alternate)	20 (5)			
	Hand Vote Aye				
	Hand Vote Nay				
	Hand Vote Abstain				
	Roll Call Vote Aye				
	Roll Call Vote Nay				
	Roll Call Vote Abstain				